

# Final Assessment Report

## Management Studies (Minor)<sup>1</sup>

### February 2017

---

#### **Summary of the Program Review:**

In accordance with the University Institutional Quality Assurance Process (IQAP), this final assessment report provides a synthesis of the arm's-length internal evaluation and the internal response and assessments of the Management Studies (MS) Minor delivered by the Department of Economics. The Self-Study Volume I was submitted to the Associate Vice-President, Academic in November 2015. This volume presented a program description, learning outcomes, and an analytical assessment of the program, as well as student and alumni survey responses and the standard data package prepared by the Office of Institutional Analysis & Planning (IAP). The Self-Study Volume II contained the CV for Geoffrey Malleck, the Director of Management Studies.

Two arm's-length internal reviewers were selected by the Associate Vice-President, Academic: Professor Scott Taylor (Chemistry), and Professor Manoj Sachdev (Electrical and Computer Engineering). Taylor and Sachdev reviewed the Self-Study documentation and conducted a site visit on February 5, 2016. The visit included interviews with the Associate Vice-President (Academic), Dean of Arts, Associate Dean of Arts (Undergraduate), the Chair and the Undergraduate Associate Chair in the Department of Economics, the Director of MS, administrative support staff and students currently enrolled in the minor.

This final assessment report is based on information extracted, in many cases verbatim, from the self-study, the reviewers' report and the program response.

#### **Program characteristics:**

The Management Studies Minor is designed to provide the theoretical background relevant (1) to current management practice useful in many entry-level management positions and (2) as a basis for further education in management. The Management Studies Minor provides a unique opportunity for students in non-business programs to complement their primary area of study with a practical knowledge of business management.

The program targets students studying for an honours degree and general degree students whose career goals are connected to management.

---

<sup>1</sup> An MS option was offered up until August 2012, at which time all options were removed from the Faculty of Arts. In addition, as of September 2015, Management Studies was offered as a minor, hence a diploma in this program is no longer available.

## Summary of strengths, challenges and weaknesses based on self-study:

### Strengths

- Director teaches several courses to students enrolled in the Management Studies Minor including ECON 344/ARBUS 302 and ARBUS 400 and is able to garner feedback for program improvement on a continuous basis.
- Given the program director's strong community ties in the business community, professionals in business are able to advise on desired outcomes from the program. In the past, this has been done by consulting an informal group of individuals from the private sector who were willing to offer perspective on the design of ARBUS 200, 300, and 400.
- 85% of current students feel the courses offered in the minor are of value to career aspirations.
- Project management modules offered in the Management Studies Minor allow students to qualify to write the Certified Associate in Project Management (CAPM).
- While a majority of students enrolled in the minor reside in the faculty of Arts, an increased interest and participation in the program from students from other faculties has been noted. This has been realized without any promotion. More deliberate promotion in other Faculties will likely attract additional students.

### Challenges & Weaknesses

- While Management Studies does not offer specific courses, there has been an effort to collaborate with other programs in the Faculty of Arts, specifically the Arts and Business program.
- Increased number of students enrolled in the minor has created some enrollment challenges. From less than 50, five years ago, the program has grown to over 300. Reserve spaces in classes for students in the minor have increased demand for the courses.
- The potential overlap with other programs (e.g., Entrepreneurship Minor) may confuse students as to which program is the best match for their goals.
- Students are sometimes unable to complete the program requirements due to lack of space in the required classes. This is not under the control of the program itself.
- The ability to earn a minor in Management Studies has been largely ignored as a means to attract students to the University of Waterloo. Marketing and Undergraduate

Recruitment could leverage the popularity of the minor to attract students who wish to pursue a liberal arts degree while gaining limited exposure to important management practices.

### **Summary of key findings from the external reviewers:**

Overall, alumni and current students provided mainly positive feedback about all of the required courses, the quality of teaching and the minor in general. All four of the students interviewed thought that the number of required courses (8) was appropriate. As of 2012, the MS students are required to take ARBUS 200 and ARBUS 400. The inclusion of ARBUS 400, a capstone course where students are placed in a dynamic simulation, is seen as being particularly constructive as judged by the very positive feedback received from students who are currently taking this course as well as alumni who took the course. This simulation allows students to assume the role of a business owner making decisions about launching and promoting a product in the market place. The simulation uses commercially available software. The project management modules offered in the MS Minor allow students to qualify to write the Certified Associate in Project Management (CAPM) exam. CAPM certification was looked upon as being important to the four students that were interviewed. Several alumni wished to see courses that are less technical but more practical – it is possible that these alumni did not have the opportunity to take ARBUS 400. Several current students expressed a desire for a public speaking course and a leadership development course in the minor (as options).

### **Program response to external reviewer recommendations: Recommendations**

1. The enrolment in the MS Minor has increased significantly in recent years. Should enrolment continue to significantly increase then we recommend that the minimum average for enrolment be increased back to 70 % or even higher.<sup>2</sup> This would give the MS Minor some degree of exclusivity and help to ensure that the MS Minor will be conferred upon highly-qualified students. We would expect that such students would be highly sought after by potential employers. The Minor should also be publicized within the university, and outside to further improve the quality of incoming students.

**Response:** Almost all minors in the Faculty of Arts have a minimum special average (computed across all courses that may be used towards the minor) of 65%. The reviewers suggest an increase in this average requirement in order to control increasing enrollments

---

<sup>2</sup> The minimum average was previously 70% before being reduced to 65%.  
February 2017

(and thus course demands) and to make the minor more highly valued/exclusive. The Curriculum Committee will consider whether a higher minimum average is warranted for the MS minor.

2. Allow MS Minor students to take ARBUS 300 and ARBUS 400 in the same term (ARBUS 300 is currently a prerequisite for ARBUS 400). This would help alleviate scheduling issues that some of the students have encountered and it appears that the two course can be taken independently of one another.

**Response:** This recommendation will be reviewed by the newly established Curriculum Committee.

3. Eight is an appropriate number of required courses for the Minor and should not be increased or decreased.

**Response:** No response needed.

4. A set of optional courses should be developed to further enrich the Minor. For example, a public speaking course and a leadership development course should be considered. Resources should be provided for the development and mounting of these new courses.

**Response:** The Department of Economics is undergoing a full review of the minor to determine opportunities to build a better minor. A curriculum committee has been struck with the goal of determining the best courses (existing or new) to deliver within the minor. Factored into the dialogue is the potential to introduce Management Studies courses. This is being driven by several factors including a requirement to move away from ARBUS 200, 300 and 400 as required courses for the MS minor, at the request of the Associate Dean, Co-op, Administration and Planning

5. Involve entrepreneurs and other local business persons in the program either as guest lecturers or as informal advisors/mentors for students.

**Response:** The director has made it a regular practice to survey local employers, community leaders for input on any potential change. Students are also given an opportunity to share their perspective on existing and proposed changes. Recruiting local leaders as guest lecturers and mentors would be highly valuable to the students, and is already done to some degree in the ARBUS program. The Curriculum Committee will consider the possibilities for involving local employers and community leaders in the revised curriculum.

6. Establish a curriculum committee. This committee would meet periodically (perhaps 2-3 times a year for the next 2-3 years and then annually). Its function would be to recommend changes in the curriculum that may be required as the minor evolves. This committee should include faculty from not only Economics (e.g., Geoff Malleck, Lutz-Alexander Busch) but also other departments from which students taking the MS Minor are enrolled (e.g., political science, etc.).

**Response:** This has been implemented. A committee consisting of four individuals has been struck. The members are Geoffery Malleck, Olivia Mesta, Joel Blit and the committee is chaired by Lutz-Alexander Busch (Associate Chair, Undergrad). An initial meeting (August 11, 2016) reviewed the objectives and desired outcomes of the minor, determined group objectives and listed viable subjects that should be considered. We have not included other departments on the curriculum committee since the program is entirely housed in Economics. However, the committee will consult with other departments where there is significant involvement of their students.

7. As pointed out in the MS Nov. 2015 self-study report and the previous assessment of the MS Minor in 2009, *“the heavy reliance on existing courses is not optimal for promoting the professional identity and community-membership goals of the program.”* This minor should have its own MS designed course, whether it be a more general second year course or a very specialized fourth year course. This course would focus on the specific goals of the MS Minor (perhaps a more practical and less technical course as suggested by some alumni). It could take the place of one of the currently 8 required courses. Such a course was proposed in a previous assessment (in 2009) and strategic plan of the MS Minor but it does not appear to have been implemented.

**Response:** Consistent with point 6 above, the Committee agreed that consideration of a course or suite of courses would serve a number of advantages including:

- Better alignment to the MS Minor objectives and outcomes;
- A revenue generating opportunity to offer the new courses to other programs;
- An opportunity to change the identity of courses that are offered as ECON xxx courses but are somewhat outside true economic theory (example- ECON 344-Marketing) to MGMT xxx designations. This can be done within the Economics Department.

8. On-line delivery of some courses should be considered (if possible). This could alleviate the scheduling issues that have been encountered.

**Response:** This will be considered when designing the updated course requirements for the minor. Some courses that are adopted into the minor may already offer the on-line version. It will also be factored into the creation of any new courses.

9. The University/Economics Department should consider promoting a double minor as an option to the ARBUS program i.e. MS minor + minor in accounting or linguistics etc. However, number of courses required for a double minor could be far fewer than sixteen.

**Response:** In the past the Minor was explicitly prohibited for any students in X & Business programs. It has been designed as an alternative to ARBUS. This suggestion would require a completely different minor that builds on ARBUS instead. It is a valuable suggestion more towards improving the ARBUS offering in Arts and should be considered in that context, but misses the current purpose of the Minor as a quite focused alternative to ARBUS.

10. There should be a small budget associated with the MS Minor.

**Response:** The task force assigned to the Minor will consider whether a budget may be needed for communication, outreach and promotional activities, as well as for specific events such as guest speakers. At the moment there are no plans to request a budget.

11. A MS web page should be established and located within the Department of Economics. This web page would enable students to easily find the necessary information about the minor and it could also act as a tool for recruiting students to UW (and from within UW) who are interested in earning a minor in MS.

**Response:** This will be done as part of initiatives that follow any changes to the minor.

12. The number of students taking this minor is now 334 (an increase of 100 from the previous year). It is very possible that enrolment will continue to increase especially if the minor is properly advertised (mainly via a MS web site). The University/Economics Department should anticipate allocating additional resources (such as additional administrative assistance, additional personnel to help with teaching, more sections for required courses etc.) in future years.

**Response:** The department has been historically understaffed. An effort to offset this has been in place but will be further influenced by the need to support this minor. This recommendation will be a component of a business plan to rebuild the MGMT minor.

13. An associate director for the minor should be appointed. This person will provide additional teaching and administrative resource to the director and could direct the program if the director was away. This individual should be a faculty member from a department that have significant interest in the minor.

**Response:** The Associate Chair-Undergraduate in the department has already invested in the program. A staff member has also assumed some of the responsibilities; primarily in admissions. We do not think that an Associate Director is needed.

14. Establishment of the curriculum committee is vital to further improve the quality, breadth, and offerings of courses. There should be a student representative on the committee.

**Response:** Accomplished as noted above.

15. The minor should be better integrated into the Economics Department (the largest group of students enrolled in the MS Minor are Economics Majors). Currently, the program appears to be run almost entirely through the director. Other personnel in the department, such as the chair, associate chair and the Economics Department as a whole, should become more involved.

**Response:** This has been accomplished with the department of Economics assuming responsibility as of the Fall Semester 2015.

16. Written rules and guidelines for admitting students to the program and classes are needed. Also, guidelines need to be established about who is looking after what – chair of department, director of MS, undergraduate officer, administrative advisor, etc.

**Response:** Several members of the department of Economics have addressed the need to craft and implement policy to better manage the minor. This will be fully addressed between September 2016 and April 2017.

17. Have all those who work on the minor use a similar advising tool (such as ASIS which is used by the Arts Undergraduate Office and Economics) to make advising notes on student files. This would eliminate some of the back and forth with students and “he said, she said” when it comes to working with students that have seen other advisors. Making notes in the system allows support staff to see any previous advice or permissions that students received.

**Response:** This recommendation will be factored into the management of the minor.

**Additional responses to reviewer comments:**

Excerpt from page 5: “Both reviewers found it challenging to find information about the MS Minor online. Some of the students we interviewed also mentioned this was a problem. As it currently stands, you can only find information regarding the minor in the Undergraduate Calendar and you have to be really looking for it to find the information.”

**Response:** We agree that information about the minor needs to be easier to find. The committee will work on this and develop a formal marketing plan after final decisions have been made regarding a possible amendment of the minor. Marketing and Undergraduate Recruitment would strongly support any effort to market this minor.

Excerpt from pages 5-6: “According to the MS Nov. 2015 self-study report (Section 8.1), the increased number of students enrolled in the minor has created enrollment challenges. Reserve spaces in classes for students in the minor have increased demand for the courses. This could become a major issue if the program continues to expand at the current rate.”

**Response:** Enrollment challenges are already an issue. This will change with the aforementioned amendments to the minor as the Arts and Business students will not share the majority of the courses. The committee will also factor this into discussions.

Excerpt from page 6: “Nevertheless, this teaching load appears to be excessive when taking into account Malleck’s additional administrative duties. This could become an issue if the program continues to expand at the current rate. In addition, in the long run, a single instructor teaching multiple course in a minor is detrimental to the overall quality of the minor.”

**Response:** Several responsibilities have already been adopted by Kayla McKinnon and Lutz Busch. The formation of the committee will also reduce the direct responsibility. It will be up to the department chair to determine any additional actions.

Excerpt from page 7: “As mentioned before, in the report UDLEs are reviewed at the degree level, and drawing strong conclusions on UDLEs for a minor is not appropriate.”

**Response:** We will refrain from referring to UDLES in future reviews. However there is value in referring to learning outcomes and attained competencies in the minor which support the attainment of UDLES.



Excerpt from page 7: “Most of the courses for the minor are taught by faculty members that are not associated with the minor, and courses are not solely delivered for the students enrolled in the minor. Therefore, it is difficult to assess the suitability and expertise of the faculty to teach courses for the minor. However, ARBUS program faculty has significant expertise in the broad area of the minor. “

**Response:** This will also be impacted by the addition of MGMT specific courses within the department of Economics. The staffing of any new courses remains the discretion of the department chair and is impacted by resource constraints. The suggestion is shared by the director and duly noted.

Excerpt from page 8: “The survey of MS alumni provided important feedback on the quality of the program. Generally, students were satisfied with the education they received in the minor, however, they would like to add more breadth in course selection, and in some cases more rigor in offered courses. For example, topics such as human resource management, accounting and finance, inter-personal communication, etc. Similarly, some students observed that there is too much focus on entrepreneurship in the minor.”

**Response:** This Curriculum Committee will address this comment and, in particular, the extent to which entrepreneurship should be a topic for the MS Minor.

Excerpt from page 8: “Now that MS is housed in the Economics Department, and more people are involved with the program, Mary Synnott and Kayla McKinnon expressed the need for written rules and guidelines for admitting students to the program and classes so there is a clear work-flow, and reduced subjectivity in the decision making.”

**Response:** Now that oversight has shifted to Economics it will be important to create a work-flow and decision making hierarchy which addresses a number of concerns including student enrolment, responsibilities, marketing, data accumulation and dissemination.

**Implementation Plan:**

	Recommendations	Proposed Actions	Responsibility for Leading and Resourcing (if applicable) the Actions	Timeline for addressing Recommendations
1.	Establishing a curriculum committee <b>Recommendations 6, 14</b>	This has been done.	Undergrad Associate Chair	NA
2.	Recommendations regarding the MS Minor curriculum such as the replacement of ARBUS courses with MS specific courses, possible on-line course delivery, developing optional courses to further enrich the minor, overlap with entrepreneurship, and recruiting of local business leaders as mentors. <b>Recommendations 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9,</b>	All of these will be addressed by the new Curriculum Committee	Undergrad Associate Chair	Begin immediately and address over 2016-2018
3.	Raising the required average for the minor to 70%. <b>Recommendation 1</b>	To be considered by the new Curriculum Committee in consultation with the Chair and Associate Dean, Undergrad.	Undergrad Associate Chair	Begin immediately and address over 2016-2018
4	Making information about the minor easier to find <b>Recommendations 11, 12</b>	Improve information available on Arts and Economics web pages.	Department Chair	2018
5.	Address enrollment challenges relating to MS students in Arts and Business Courses <b>Recommendations 2, 4, 9</b>	To be addressed as part of reforms proposed by curriculum committee as noted in point 1 above.	Undergrad Associate Chair	2016 -2018

6.	Address the seemingly excessive teaching load of Geoffrey Malleck <b>Recommendation 13</b>	Reduce administrative responsibilities of Geoffrey Malleck related to the minor with more assistance from staff, if possible.	Department Chair	2016 -2017
7.	Obtain a small budget for the MS Minor <b>Recommendation 10</b>	This request will be made in the next budget year.	Department Chair	February 2018
8.	Address the staff needs of the minor <b>Recommendation 15</b>	The administrative work load associated with the minor will be monitored over the coming year. More staff resources will be requested if deemed necessary.	Department Chair	2016-2018
9.	Better integrate the administration of the program into the Economics Department administration. <b>Recommendations 15, 16</b>	The administrative procedures used in the Economics Department will now be adopted for the MS Minor.	Department Chair, Associate Chair, Undergrad, Program Director	2017-2018
10.	Establish written rules and guideline for the program. <b>Recommendation 16</b>	This will be worked on by the appropriate staff and faculty.	Associate Chair, Undergrad and Program Director.	2017-2018
11.	Use of ASIS for advising <b>Recommendation 17</b>	This will be considered in the next year.	Associate Chair, Undergrad and Program Director	2017

*Note: Reviewer's Recommendation 3 requires no action and therefore is not in the implementation table above.*

The Department Chair/Director, in consultation with the Dean of the Faculty shall be responsible for monitoring the Implementation Plan.

**Date of next program review:** \_\_\_\_\_ **2022**  
Date

---

**Signatures of Approval:**

---

Chair/Director \_\_\_\_\_ Date

---

AFIW Administrative Dean/Head (For AFIW programs only) \_\_\_\_\_ Date

---

Faculty Dean \_\_\_\_\_ Date

---

Associate Vice-President, Academic \_\_\_\_\_ Date  
(For undergraduate and augmented programs)

---

Associate Provost, Graduate Studies \_\_\_\_\_ Date  
(For graduate and augmented programs)