Research Resources and Methods for Classical Studies
GIVE UP, LARRY! YOU’LL NEVER KNOW EVERYTHING!

ALL THOSE YEARS OF SCHOOL AND YOU’VE BARELY SCRATCHED THE SURFACE!

WE COULD FILL A ROOM WITH WHAT YOU DON’T KNOW... IN FACT, WE HAVE!

HA HA!

HA!

HA HA!
Alas, the rest of this session is not so entertaining – you’re in for a rather dull hour or two...
Primary Sources
The Importance of Primary Sources

- Literature, inscriptions, papyri, material remains, etc.
- Our only evidence for antiquity
- Original language (Latin and/or Greek)
- Comprehensive approach
Case Study: Kleisthenes of Athens, “The Father of Democracy”
What would you do if you were about to write an essay on Kleisthenes?
Primary Sources: See Handout on Kleisthenes

- Literary –
  - Herodotos and [Aristotle] *Athenaion Politeia*
  - Fragmentary authors:
    - Kleitodemos of Athens
Herodotus on Kleisthenes’ motivations:
“Kleisthenes of Athens, following the lead of his grandfather and namesake Kleisthenes of Sikyon, decided, out of contempt, I imagine, for the Ionians, that his tribes should not be the same as theirs...”

Aristotle on Kleisthenes’ motivations:
“He first distributed all the citizens through ten tribes instead of the old four, wanting to mix them up so that more men should have a share in the running of the state...”
Literary Sources on Kleisthenes: The Question of Demes and Trityyes

Small local units:

- c. 150 Demes
- 3 geographical groupings
  - Each region has 10 Trityes
- 30 Trityes in all
- 10 Tribes (Phylai)
  - Each composed of 1 Trity from each Region

Council of 500
- 50 members from each tribe

DIAGRAM OF KLEISTHENES' POLITICAL ORGANISATION
Primary Sources: See Handout on Kleisthenes

• Literary –
  – Herodotos and [Aristotle] Athenaion Politeia
  – Fragmentary authors:
    • Kleitodemos of Athens

• Epigraphic –
  – IG I³ 1031 (the Athenian Archon List)
The Fragments of the Athenian Archon List
Fragment of IG I3 1031

[K]LEISTHEN[ES]

LEIΣΟΕΝ
The Fragments of the Athenian Archon List

Miltiades 524/3
Kleisthenes 525/4
Primary Sources: See Handout on Kleisthenes

• Literary –
  – Herodotos and [Aristotle] Athenaion Politeia
  – Fragmentary authors:
    • Kleitodemos of Athens

• Epigraphic –
  – IG I³ 1031 (the Athenian Archon List)

• Material remains?
  – Only indirect, such as the 4th-century Monument of the Eponymous Heroes or the mapping of the Athenian demes
The Monument of the Eponymous Heroes
The Kleisthenic Deme System
The Importance of Primary Sources

• Literature, inscriptions, papyri, material remains, etc.
• Our only evidence for antiquity
• Original language (Latin or Greek)
• Comprehensive approach
• Critical approach: engage with the sources, don’t simply cite them
Engaging with the Sources

• Primary and secondary
• Don’t try to make them fit or match
• Address controversies directly
• Engage with the authors –
  – “Herodotos says this, but Aristotle says that….”
  – “Sealey argues for x, but Hansen’s claim of y is more convincing….”
• If there is truly insufficient evidence, don’t be afraid of an “aporetic” conclusion
Aside: Comment on Source Criticism and Historiography....

“The rest were put in prison by the Athenians and executed, amongst them Timesitheus of Delphi, a man of whose prowess and courage I could, if I would, tell great things.”

(Herodotos 5.72)

(If you want to know who he was, look at Pausanias 6.8.6)
The Importance of Primary Sources

• Literature, inscriptions, papyri, material remains, etc.
• Our only evidence for antiquity
• Original language (Latin or Greek)
• Comprehensive approach
• Critical approach: engage with the sources, don’t simply cite them
• Collect and review all primary sources first, if possible
Using Commentaries and Apparatus

• Commentaries
  – E.g., Rhodes on the Aristotelian Athenaios Politeia
ARISTOTLE
THE ATHENIAN
CONSTITUTION
198 pages
(including more than 100 pages of notes and commentary)

A COMMENTARY
ON THE ARISTOTELIAN
ATHENAION POLITEIA
824 pages
P. J. RHODES
CLARENDON PAPERBACKS
Using Commentaries and Apparatus

• Commentaries
  – E.g., Rhodes on the Aristotelian Athenaion Politeia

• Apparatus Criticus
The Apparatus Criticus

The Apparatus Criticus

The Oxford Classical Text (OTC) of Demosthenes

SIGLA

S = cod. Parisinus 2934
A = cod. Augustanus primus, nunc
   Monacensis 485
r = cod. Parisinus 2936
F = cod. Marcianus 416
B = cod. Bavarius, nunc Monacensis 85
Q = cod. Marcianus 418
D = cod. Ambrosianus 112
Y = cod. Parisinus 2935
P = cod. Laurentianus pliat. lix 9
C = cod. Ambrosianus 235

saec. x (fortasse ix)
saec. xi (fortasse x)
saec. xiv
saec. xi (fortasse x)
saec. xiii
saec. xi (fortasse x)
saec. xi (fortasse x)
saec. xi (fortasse x)
saec. xi (fortasse x)
saec. xiv

Sextam hanc epistolam om. S
Titulus: τῶν Ἀθηναίων codd., corr. Dindorf
I. G. II. 467, Foucart, Journal des Savants, 1912
11 εἰς τὸν
scripsi: αὐτῶν codd.
πρέπει Q: προστρέψις F1 (σ del. F corr.)
12 (τὰ) γράμματα Schaefer
16 τῷ om. Q
17 ἐπὶ τῆν
Schaefer τὸ τῆς Blass: τὸι legebatur 18 ἐς mg. edit. Paris.: ἐν
A codd. ἐξειν Reiske: ἐξειν codd.
In F subscriptum

ΠΡΟΣ ΤΗΝ ΒΟΥΛΗΝ ΚΑΙ ΤΟΝ ΔΗΜΟΝ ΤΟΝ ἈΘΗΝΑΙΩΝ

Δημοσθένης τῇ βουλῇ καὶ τῷ δημῷ χαίρειν. ἢθινεν 5 ἐπιστολή παρ’ Ἀντιφίλου πρὸς τοὺς τῶν συμμάχων συνε- δροὺς, τοὺς μὲν βουλουμένους ἄγαθα προσδοκῶν ἰκανόνυ γεγραμ- μένη, τοῖς δ’ ὑπηρετούσων Ἀντιπάτρω πολλοὺς καὶ ἐνεχερείς ἀπολείπουσα λόγους, οἱ παραλαβόντες τὰ παρ’ Ἀντιπάτρου γράμματα πρὸς Δέλφων εἰς Κύριων ἔλθοντα,

10 ἀπάσας τὰς ἔν Πελοποννήσῳ πόλεις τοιοῦτων λόγων ἐπλη- σαν ὀίων εἰς κεφαλὴν αὐτοὺς πρέπειαν οἱ θεοί. ἀφικομένου 2 δὲ τοῦ νῦν ἢκοντος μετὰ τοῦ παρ’ ἔμοι φέροντος γράμματα παρὰ Πολεμαίστον πρὸς τῶν ἀδελφόν Ἐπίνικου, ἤδει’ ὑμῖν [1492] ἐνων καὶ ἐμοὶ φίλοι, κάκεινον πρὸς ἔμ’ ἀγανότος, ἀκού.

15 σαντὶ μοι ἀ ἐλεγεν ἐδοκεῖ πρὸς ὑμᾶς αὐτῶν ἀποστείλαι, ὅπως πάντα σαφῆς ἀκούσατε τὰ ἐν τῷ στρατόπεδῳ γεγο- νότα τοῦ περὶ τὴν μάχην παραγεγεννημένον τὸ τ’ εἰς τὸ παρὸν θαρρῆτε, καὶ τὰ λοιπὰ τῶν θεῶν θελόντων ὡς βουλευθ’ ἐξειν ὑπολαμβάνητε. εὐνυχεῖτε.
1 XXIX. Ἡ ἑσών μὲν οὖν ἱσόρροπα τὰ πράγματα κατὰ τὸν πόλεμον ἢν διεφύλαττον τὴν δημοκρατίαν. ἐπεὶ δὲ μετὰ τὴν ἐν Σικελίᾳ γενομένην συμφορὰν ἱσχυροτάτα τὰ τῶν Λακεδαιμονίων ἐγένετο διὰ τὴν πρὸς βασίλεα συμμαχίαν, ἡναγκάσθησαν κυνηγάστες τὴν δημοκρατίαν καταστήσας τὴν ἐπὶ τῶν τετρακοσίων πολιτείαν. ἐπίσης τὸν μὲν πρὸ τοῦ ψιφύσματος λόγον Μηλιδίου, τὴν γὰρ γραφαινός Πιθαδώρα τὸν Ἀμαλυσίου, μάλιστα δὲ συμπεπεσθέντων τῶν πολλῶν διὰ τὸ νομίζεις βασίλεα μᾶλλον ἐαυτοῖς συμπολεμήσεις οὐκ ἔδει ὅλων πολεμήσαι τὴν πολιτείαν. ἕν τοῦ ἄρκετο τὸν Πιθαδώρα τοιοῦτόν τι, τὴν δήμον εἶχε εἰς τοὺς προϊστάμενους ἄλλους εἰκοσί εἰς τῶν ὑπὲρ τεταράκοντα ἐτῶν γεγονότων, οὕτως ὁμόσαστα ὃ μήν συγγράφεις ἢ ἂν ἤγγιτο βέλτιστα εἶναι εἰς τὸ πόλει συγγράφουσιν περί τῆς τῶν σωτηρίας. Εἴτε δὲ καὶ ἄλλον τῶν ἄλλων τοῖς ψυχομένων γράφεις, ὡς ἢ ἄπαντος ἀρίστου τὸ ἄρστον. Κλειτοφός δὲ τὰ μὲν ἄλλα καθάπερ Πιθαδώρα ἔπειτα, προσανατίσησε δὲ τοὺς ἀκεραίους ἐγραφαί καὶ τοὺς πατρίς τοὺς νόμος τῆς Κλειτοβεινῆς ἐθεικῆς ὑπὸ τὴν καθήσθην τὴν δημοκρατίαν, ὡς ἂν ἂν ἀκούστησαν καὶ τοὺς βουλεύσθησεν τὸ ἄρστον, ὡς δὲ δημοτικῷ ἄλλα παραπληγίαν ὅπως ἄνω τὴν Κλει-

4 σθένους πολιτείαν τῇ Ἑλλάδας. οἱ δ’ ἀκεραίους πρῶτον μὲν ἐγραφαί ἐπικάπηκε εἰς τοὺς πρωτο-

1 Richards: διαφορὰν cod.
2 ἱσχυρότερα Mayor.
3 πρὸ] περὶ Wyse.
4 Blass: ... v. πιῶν cod.
5 ὥσποτ ἢ παρὰ Wilamowitz-Kaibel.
Using Commentaries and Apparatus

• Commentaries
  – E.g., Rhodes on the Aristotelian *Athenaion Politeia*

• *Apparatus Criticus*

• The need to consult the original text (i.e., not rely on translations)
  – Cautionary example: the Loeb text and translation of Polybios 28.17.4 (W.R. Paton, 1927)
Toû δ' Αγεπόλιδος ἐψυχαγωγημένου κατὰ τὴν ὅλην ἀπάντησιν ἱσχυρῶς, λαβὼν αὐτὸν κατ' ἱδίαν εἰς τὰς χεῖρας ὁ Κόιντος θαυμάζειν ἔφη πῶς οὗ πειρῶνται διαλύειν οἱ Ῥόδιοι τὸν ἐνεστῶτα πόλεμον, μάλιστα τοῦ πράγματος ἐκείνοις καθήκοντος.

The whole tenour of his reply charmed and touched Hagepolis profoundly; and afterwards Marcius, taking him aside, said he wondered why the Rhodians made no attempt to put an end to the present war between Antiochus and Ptolemy, as it was their business to do so if anyone’s.
The whole tenour of his reply charmed and touched Hagepolis profoundly; and afterwards Marcius, taking him aside, said he wondered why the Rhodians made no attempt to put an end to the present war between Antiochus and Ptolemy, as it was their business to do so if anyone’s.
Polybios 28.17.4: Which war?

The whole tenour of his reply charmed and touched Hagepolis profoundly; and afterwards Marcius, taking him aside, said he wondered why the Rhodians made no attempt to put an end to the present war between Antiochus and Ptolemy, as it was their business to do so if anyone’s.

Τοῦ δ’ Αγεπόλιδος ἔψυχαγωγημένου κατὰ τὴν ὅλην ἀπάντησιν ἱσχυρῶς, λαβὼν αὐτὸν κατ’ ἱδίαν εἰς τὰς χεῖρας ὁ Κόιντος θαυμάζειν ἔφη πῶς οὐ πειρῶνται διαλύειν οἱ Ῥόδιοι τὸν ἐνεστῶτα πόλεμον, μάλιστα τοῦ πράγματος ἐκείνους καθήκοντος.
Depth of Research?

- A 2nd-year CLAS 251 essay
  - Herodotos & Aristotle
  - IG I³ 1031 (in translation)
  - Commentary, even if superficially

- A 4th-year CLAS 486 essay
  - Herodotos & Aristotle
  - Fragmentary author(s) (separate commentaries)
  - IG I³ 1031 (in Greek)
  - Commentaries in depth
  - If relevant, material remains and topographical studies
Constructing a Bibliography

South Library, Athenaeum Club, London
Primary Sources

- Secondary works on the topic
- Reading/browsing
- Database searching
Databases for Primary Sources

- Perseus Digital Library
- The Latin Library
- PHI Latin Texts
- Brill Online –
  - *Fragmente der griechischen Historiker*
  - *Brill’s New Jacoby*
  - *Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum*
- SEG/IG concordance
- PHI Searchable Greek Inscriptions
- Electronic Archive of Greek and Latin Epigraphy
General Limitations of Databases (there are exceptions)

• Abbreviated or no commentary
• Generally no *apparatus criticus* to ancient texts
• No sense of formatting (e.g., inscriptions)
• Excellent for browsing, searching, collecting – but second step is to review the hard-copy publications of the primary sources
• Triple redundancy is always a good idea
Secondary Sources

- Course bibliographies
- Monograph and article bibliographies
- *L’Année Philologique*
- *Gnomon* and *Gnomon Online*
- TOCS-IN
- ISI Web of Knowledge (Web of Science)
Note on Secondary Sources

• Importance of modern languages other than English
• Widely varying quality
• Database shortcomings similar to primary sources (triple redundancy again a good idea)
• Sources on the Web?
  – Not unless you really know what you’re doing!
  – The ones covered in this tutorial are all just fine
Obtaining Items

• Journal abbreviations
  – Aristarchos
  – *L’Année Philologique*

• TUG libraries: holdings and licenses
  – E.g., JSTOR

• UW Classical Studies Library

• Interlibrary Loan (RACER)
Scholarly Encyclopedias

- Pauly-Wissowa Realenzyklopädie
- Brill’s New Pauly
- Oxford Classical Dictionary (OCD)
- Oxford Encyclopedia of Ancient Greece & Rome
- Wiley-Blackwell’s Encyclopedia of Ancient History
Other Electronic Resources

- Electronic Resources for Classicists
- Ancient World On-Line (AWOL)
- The Stoa Consortium
- Research Databases for Classical Studies (UW)
- Bryn Mawr Classical Review
Citation Methods
(we’re almost done...)
Citation Methods in Classical Studies

• When do you need to cite a source?
  – Common knowledge (“the Peloponnesian War broke out in 431 BCE”) does not require citation
  – *Everything else does!!!*
  – Very broad rule (tons of exceptions):
    • Items of fact require primary source citation
    • Items of interpretation require secondary source citation

• Style?
  – APA/MLA/Chicago – who cares? Not me…

• See RefWorks (UW Library) for assistance
• Simplicity combined with efficiency is key
Primary Sources

“After the expulsion of the Peisistratid tyrants, Athenian politics revolved around the rivalry between Kleisthenes and Isagoras (Hdt. 5.66; AthPol 20.1).”
“The complex tribal arrangements put into place by Kleisthenes assisted in breaking the stranglehold that the old aristocracy still had on political power (Camp 2001: 40-41).”
Aside: putting things in your own words

Camp’s words:

“‘Governing, fighting, and feasting with a new group of fellow tribesmen drawn from all three regions of Attica forged new bonds of loyalty and greatly diminished the power, influence, and control of the local aristocratic families. The tribes thus became the new focus for political power as well as for social and religious activity.’ (Camp 2001: 40-41).”
Aside: putting things in your own words

Insufficiently modified:

“The new tribal groupings resulted in men drawn from all three regions of Attica governing, fighting, and feasting together. This system forged new loyalties and the power, influence, and control of the local aristocracies were significantly diminished. Political power and social and religious activity were now focused on the tribes. (Camp 2001: 40-41).”
Aside: putting things in your own words

“Governing, fighting, and feasting with a new group of fellow tribesmen drawn from all three regions of Attica forged new bonds of loyalty and greatly diminished the power, influence, and control of the local aristocratic families. The tribes thus became the new focus for political power as well as for social and religious activity.”

“The new tribal groupings resulted in men drawn from all three regions of Attica governing, fighting, and feasting together. This system forged new loyalties and the power, influence, and control of the local aristocracies were significantly diminished. Political power and social and religious activity were now focused on the tribes.”
Aside: putting things in your own words

Sufficiently modified:

“The complex tribal arrangements put into place by Kleisthenes assisted in breaking the stranglehold that the old aristocracy still had on political power (Camp 2001: 40-41).”
List of References


Questions?
Because if you have any – now or later – just ask!